

Inception Report R7976

Institutional Evaluation of Caribbean MPAs and opportunities for pro-poor management

1. INTRODUCTION

This report fulfils a requirement on MRAG to provide a short report on progress over a 3 month inception period. The project began on the 7th of March 2001 and runs for 19 months until 30th September 2002. Note that for planning purposes, it has been agreed that month one of the project is April 2001 and the following timetable will be used for implementation.

MPA timing				Activity deadlines, from logframe			
Calendar year	Calendar months	Project months	DFID annual period	O1	O2	O3	O4
2001	March	-	00/01				
	April	1	Q1 01/02				
	May	2					
	June	3		A1.1+1.2			
	July	4	Q2 01/02				A4.1
	August	5					
	September	6					A4.2
	October	7	Q3 01/02				
	November	8			A2.2		A4.3
	December	9					
2002	January	10	Q4 01/02		A2.1+2.3+ 2.5	A3.1+3.2	
	February	11				A3.3	
	March	12					
	April	13	Q1 02/03	A1.3	A2.4+2.6		
	May	14			A2.7		
	June	15			A2.7	A3.4	A4.4
	July	16	Q2 02/03				A4.3
	August	17					A4.5
	September	18					A4.6

2. KEY AREAS OF PROGRESS

2.1 Output 1: characterisation

CANARI have responsibility for reviewing MPA's to develop a characterisation. A standard data sheet (Annex I) is being used to collate information from 78 MPA's across the Caribbean. The data collection is continuing, to date 55 references have been drawn on to complete the data sheets. The technical report is due at the end of June 2001. Preliminary information has been collated into a single table to provide an overview of countries, MPAs and status, i.e. is an MPA operational (first level of 'success' criteria needed for output 2 activities). An extract from this table is included in Annex II of this report. At this stage, the table helps with site selection for the case studies.

Note that the timetable for the student projects (activity 3.2) has meant we have had to bring forward the selection of the operational, i.e. successful, sites. This does not affect the overall design, as additional sites can be added should the more comprehensive characterisation highlight an MPA of interest. The site selection at this stage is based on several criteria applied to MPA's covered in the characterisation as follows:

- Include only countries from within DFID/LWI geographic focus;
- Include countries to provide case studies from mainland, large islands and SIDS
- Include MPA's that were established more than 5 years ago and are operational, i.e. rules are largely kept and widely known;
- Include MPA's where resources are important to livelihoods of local communities and poverty is a significant factor in these areas.
- Include MPA's whose objectives explicitly include that local communities will benefit from the park
- Include operational MPA's that provide the project with good coverage of different institutional arrangements, e.g. government and NGO etc.

2.2 Output 3: student projects to support research

Dr Hazel Oxenford and Dr Winston Anderson have prepared short outlines of potential student projects that would be carried out in association with this research. Three core areas were defined, each calling for two students. The titles are as follows:

Project I. Marine Protected Areas (MPAs) within the Wider Caribbean: I. A Review of National Policy and Legislation Contributing to, or Constraining Successful MPA Implementation.

Project II. Marine Protected Areas (MPAs) within the Wider Caribbean: II. An Assessment of the Ecological Impacts of Successfully Implemented MPAs.

Project III. Marine Protected Areas (MPAs) within the Wider Caribbean: III. An Assessment of the Impacts of Successfully Implemented MPAs on the Livelihoods of Stakeholders

Student responses have been very positive and we have 6 students currently interested in the projects. Once the MPA project has finalised site selection and reviewed the students formal proposals, field work can begin.

2.3 Output 4: information briefs

MRAG, UWI and CANARI have recently finalised the first project brief, as part of the email-based strategy to inform and engage stakeholders in the research. The team has agreed an initial list of individuals, organisations and general list servers that will be used to disseminate the brief electronically (Table 1). In addition, members of the team (Nicole Kenward and Hazel Oxenford) will attend a LWI workshop in Barbados in June where hard copies of the brief will be disseminated. Hard copies will also be distributed to MPA management and institutions by UWI students during their field work. A copy of the brief is attached to this report as Annex III. The next brief will be developed on the basis of the technical report on the characterisation, site selection and student projects.

Table 1 Dissemination list for MPA project briefs

LIST SERVERS	MANAGED BY	MEMBERSHIP
CaMPAM	UNEP-CEP	MPA's and their managers, fisheries officers, and relevant partner institutions (such as those of IUCN, CCA, CARICOMP, FAO, US-NPS)
Caribbean Biodiversity Conservation	caribbean-biodiversity-owner	Scientists, planners, managers and researchers working in the Caribbean
CARICOMP	A central Data Management Centre (DMC) at the University of the West Indies in Kingston, Jamaica	Twenty-five marine laboratories, parks and reserves, in 13 islands and 9 mainland countries have now joined.

LIST SERVERS	MANAGED BY	MEMBERSHIP
CCA (Caribbean Conservation Association)	Coastal and marine management programme (CaMMP); Coastal resources co-management project (CORECOMP)	20 governments, 87 Caribbean-based NGO's, 17 non- Caribbean institutes, 350 associates,
CARIBWA	Caribbean and Western Atlantic Marine Educators association	
Coral list	NOAA	The list is primarily for use by coral health researchers and scientists. Currently, about 1600 researchers are subscribed
GCFInet (Gulf & Caribbean Fisheries Institute)	http://ultra.tamu.edu/rbd/gcficomlist.htm	Fisheries scientists of the Gulf of Mexico and Caribbean
GCRMN/ ReefCheck	IOC, UNEP, WMO and IUCN have joined forces to co-sponsor the GCRMN, which is hosted jointly by AIMS (Australian Institute of Marine Science) and ICLARM (International Center for Living Aquatic Resources Management)	Coral reef researchers and environmental activists
IUCN regional parks network (dormant)	Sr. Antonio Perera Puga, Centro Nacional de Areas Protegidas, Calle 18, A No. 4114 entre 41 y 47, Miramar, Playa C Habana 11300, CUBA	
SIDSnet	Dr. Carol James Programme Specialist for Sustainable Development and Environment UNDP, Trinidad and Tobago	Stakeholders from SIDS
ORGANISATIONS		REMIT
UNEP-CEP	Alessandra Khouri	Programme Officer-Specially Protected Areas and Wildlife (SPAW)
CCA	Dr Patrick McConney, CaMMP, Caribbean Conservation Association, Chelford, Bush Hill, The Garrison, St Michael, Barbados	The CCA is an NGO which has for over 30 years focused on the conservation, protection and wise use of the region's natural and cultural resources
Marine and Coastal Resource Management	Tom van't Hof, The Bottom, Saba, Netherlands Antilles	
OECS	Vasantha Chase Head, NRM Unit, Morne Fortune, PO Box 1383, Castries, St Lucia	NRM for Eastern Caribbean States

2.4 MoU with Caribbean partners

MRAG has signed an MoU with the Natural Resource Management programme, of University of West Indies to cover the input of Dr Oxenford and Dr Anderson. The submission of this report coincides with the agreement between MRAG and CANARI for the characterisation work being finalised.

3. CONCLUSION

We are happy with the progress to date and therefore see no reason why the project goal can not be achieved or needs to be modified.

ANNEX I MPA Characterisation Data Form

Country:

Name of MPA:

Basic Information
Management status:
Size (marine and terrestrial):
Biogeographic description:
Information on Legal Status
When was the MPA legally established?
What legislative instruments created the MPA and govern its management?
Do these legislative instruments include management regulations?
Information on Institutional Arrangements
What agency or organization is responsible for day-to-day management of the MPA? If more than one, note the role of each
What other agencies or organizations have active roles in management? What are these roles?
What Ministry or branch of government has overall authority over management?
If management responsibility has been delegated to a non-governmental entity, what mechanisms or instruments were used to do so?
Do any mechanisms exist for regular stakeholder consultation and input? If so, what are these?
Do the existing management arrangements appear to be reasonably efficient?
Information on Management
Are there stated management objectives? What are they?
Is there a management plan? Include citation if available
What are the major activities carried out within the MPA?
What, if any, conflicts exist between these activities?
Does the MPA have active management? If not, skip the rest of the questions in this section
How is the MPA funded?
Briefly list existing management programmes
What staff positions currently exist?
If regulations are in place, are they actively enforced? If so, by whom?
What are the major types of regulation?
Is zoning used as a tool for management? If so, describe zones
Do any management programmes address livelihood issues of local communities? If so, describe
Socio-economic information
Are there any communities within or adjacent to the MPA-s boundaries? If so, name and give rough estimate of population size
Are persons from these communities or elsewhere dependent on resources in the the MPA for their livelihoods? If so, note the level of dependency and relative number of persons involved (e.g., a substantial portion of the population moderately dependent)
What are the major socio-economic activities of the areas surrounding the MPA, in order of importance?
How important are activities dependent on MPA resources relative to other activities, e.g. farming?
Roughly what portion of the population of adjacent communities can be considered to be living in poverty or at risk?

References:

Contacts:

Country	Protected Area	Year Established	Level of Management	DFID focus?
Antigua and Barbuda	Diamond Reef Marine Reserve	1973	None	
Antigua and Barbuda	Palaster Reef Marine Park	1973	None	
Antigua and Barbuda	Cades Bay Marine Park	1999	None yet	
Bahamas	Exuma Cays Land and Sea Park	1958	Moderate	
Bahamas	Inagua National Park	1965	Moderate	
Bahamas	Peterson Cays Land and Sea Park	1968	None	
Bahamas	Pelican Cays Land and Sea Park	1981	Low	
Barbados	Folkestone Park and Marine Reserve	1981	Moderate	
Belize	Half Moon Cay	1982	Moderate	YES
Belize	Hol Chan Marine Reserve	1987	High	YES
Belize	Glovers Reef Marine Reserve	1993	Moderate	YES
Belize	Bacalar Chico Marine Reserve and National Park	1996	Low?	YES
Belize	Blue Hole Natural Monument	1996	Low?	YES
Belize	Laughing Bird Caye National Park	1996	Low?	YES
Belize	Sopadilla Cayes Marine Reserve	1996	Low?	YES
Belize	Southwater Caye Marine Reserve	1996	Low?	YES
Belize	Caye Caulker Marine and Forest Reserve	1998	Low?	YES
Belize	Gladden Spit/Silk Cayes Marine Reserve	2000	Low?	YES
Belize	Port Honduras Marine Reserve	2001	Low?	YES
Belize	Corozal Bay Manatee Wildlife Sanctuary	?	Low?	YES
British Virgin Islands	Wreck of RMS Rhone Marine Park	1980	High	
Cayman Islands	Marine Park System	1986	Mod-High	
Cuba	Parque Nacional Caguanes	1966	Low-mod	
Cuba	Refugio de Fauna Cayos Cantiles-Avalos-Rosario	1986	None	
Cuba	Refugio de Fauna Cayos de Ana Maria	1992	None	
Cuba	Refugio de Fauna de Rio Maximo	1992	None	
Cuba	Parque Nacional Punta Frances	1996	Moderate	
Cuba	Reserva Ecologica Cayo Largo	1998	None	
Cuba	Parque Nacional Guanacabibes	2001	Moderate	
Cuba	Refugio de Fauna Lanzasillo	2001	Low	
Cuba	Refugio de Fauna Las Picuas	2001	Low	
Cuba	Parque Nacional Jardines de la Reina	?	Low	
Cuba	Reserva Ecologica Maternillo-Tortugilla	?	None	
Cuba	Reserva Ecologica Varahicacos-Galindo	?	Moderate	
Cuba	Elemento Natural Destacado Ojo de Megano	Proposed	Low	
Cuba	Parque Nacional Los Caimanes	Proposed	Low	
Cuba	Parque Nacional San Felipe - Los Indios	Proposed	Low	
Dominica	Cabrits National Park	1987	None-low	YES
Dominica	Soufriere/Scotts Head Marine Reserve		None?	YES
Dominican Republic	Parque Nacional del Este	1975	Moderate	
Dominican Republic	Parque Nacional Los Haitises	1976	Moderate	
Dominican Republic	Santuario de Mamiferos Marinos de la Republica	1977	Mod-High	
Dominican Republic	Parque Nacional Jaragua	1986	Moderate	
Dominican Republic	Parque Nacional Montecristi	1986	None	
Dominican Republic	Parque Nacional Submarino La Caleta	1986	Moderate	
Dominican Republic	Monumento Natural Isla Catalina	1995	None	
Dominican Republic	Area Nacional de Recreo Cayo Levantado	1996	None	
Dominican Republic	Area Nacional de Recreo Playa de Andres de B...	1996	None	
Dominican Republic	Parque Nacional Cabo Cabron	1996	None	
Dominican Republic	Reserva Biologica Humedales del Bajo Yuna, El f	1996	None	
France	Grand Cul de Sac Marin	1987	Mod-High	
France	Ilets Pigeon	1989	Moderate	
France	St. Barths Marine Reserve	1996	Moderate	
Grenada	Moliniere/Beausejour Marine Protected Area	1999	None?	YES
Grenada	Woburn Bay Marine Protected Area	1999	None?	YES
Jamaica	Montego Bay Marine Park	1992	Low	YES
Jamaica	Negril Marine Park	1995	Mod-High	YES
Jamaica	Ocho Rios Marine Park	1999	None	YES
Jamaica	Portland Bight Protected Area	1999	None	YES
Netherlands Antilles	Bonaire Marine Park	1979	High	
Netherlands Antilles	Curacao Underwater Park	1983		
Netherlands Antilles	Saba Marine Park	1987	High	
Netherlands Antilles	St. Eustatius Marine Park	1998	Moderate	
Netherlands Antilles	St. Maarten Marine Park	2001?	?	
St. Lucia	Maria Islands Nature Reserve	1982	Low	YES
St. Lucia	Soufriere Marine Management Area	1995	High	YES
St. Lucia	Canaries-Anse la Ray Marine Management Area	2000	Low	YES
St. Vincent and the Grenad	Tobago Cays Marine Reserve	1997	None	YES
Trinidad and Tobago	Buccoo Reef Marine Park	1973	Low	
Turks and Caicos Islands	Admiral Cockburn Land and Sea Park	1992		
Turks and Caicos Islands	Chalk Sound National Park	1992		
Turks and Caicos Islands	Columbus Landfall National Park	1992		
Turks and Caicos Islands	Fort George Land and Sea Park	1992		
Turks and Caicos Islands	Grand Turk Cays Land and Sea Park	1992		
Turks and Caicos Islands	Princess Alexandra National Park	1992		
Turks and Caicos Islands	West Caicos Marine Park	1992		
U.S. Virgin Islands	Virgin Islands National Park	1956	High	
U.S. Virgin Islands	Buck Island Reef National Monument	1961	High	

Shaded entries have no active management

24

Institutional Evaluation of Caribbean MPAs

May 2001

A NEW project has begun...

Brief # 1

WHAT?

The full title is: Institutional Evaluation of Caribbean MPAs and opportunities for pro-poor management. It is funded by DFID (UK Department for International Development) under their Natural Resources Systems Programme. The project (R7976) is implemented through a partnership between MRAG Ltd, a UK-based aquatic resource management company, and the Natural Resource Management Programme of the University of The West Indies (Barbados), who research and assess coastal resources in the region. This partnership benefits from the collaboration of the Caribbean Natural Resources Institute (CANARI).

WHY?

As you will know, many MPAs have been established in the last 20 years in the Caribbean as a tool for the management of coastal resources. MPAs have succeeded to varying degrees with respect to their primary aims (usually ecological such as improved conservation of coral reefs and their associated fisheries) and with respect to their acceptance and implementation (e.g. level of enforcement and compliance with MPA rules, level of conflict among communities and/or with park management). Little attention has been paid to the impact of MPAs on poorer sectors of the community relying on the resource base –

impacts which themselves may help explain some of the problems with implementation and compliance. The purpose of this project is to identify the current institutional constraints to, and development options for, successfully implementing MPAs and integrating them into coastal zone management in a way that leads to a sustained improvement in the livelihoods of coastal communities in the Caribbean. Reflecting DFID's strong focus on poverty eradication, this research is expected to lead to improved methods for implementation and management of pro-poor MPAs.

WHEN?

- The project began in April-01 and will continue for 18 months until September-02.
- The characterisation of MPAs (July-01)
- Review of existing data, literature and field-work (Feb-02)
- Regional dissemination workshop (August-02)
- Publication of Guidelines (Sept-02)

HOW will the project work?

We have begun with a review of MPAs. Information on their biophysical, user-community and institutional characteristics will be collated alongside any information available on "outcomes" or results of management. As well as providing a comprehensive review of MPAs drawing in features not usually recorded in regional databases, this **characterisation** will be used to select case study sites for more detailed analysis. Two categories of MPAs will be selected for the first level of analysis: those that are operational, i.e.

have been successfully implemented and/or integrated into CZM plans and those that have been unable to achieve this. To identify what characteristics are associated with successful implementation and CZM integration, the project will **compare the institutional design** of MPAs in both categories as well as the **legal and policy framework** in which they operate. Given that a successful implementation/integration process, as defined, doesn't necessarily imply successful outcomes, a second

level of analysis on the "successful" MPAs will address the impact of management on the **livelihoods of poorer groups**. Participatory appraisals will be used to analyse livelihoods - the community perspective of what is "success" will inform research into outcomes. An assessment of the ecological impacts of MPAs will complement this work. The information from these analyses and consultations will inform one of the key outputs of the project – **guidelines** promoting pro-poor management of MPAs.

WHERE are the project sites?

The initial characterisation review covers existing MPAs in SIDS and larger island states (Belize as an English speaking coastal mainland site will also be included).

From this, we will select the sites for the comparative analysis (successfully vs. unsuccessfully managed) and the more detailed study of the local livelihood to management links at "successful" sites.

This selection is due to be complete by June/July-01.

Watch this space!

YOUR role...

We have identified you and/or your institution as having an interest in the management of MPAs. Given the geography of the Caribbean, this project will rely heavily on email to share ideas, results and allow feedback on progress and direction of the research. To avoid the usual pitfalls of email communication (i.e. too much is sent to everyone), we aim to develop a series of project briefs, of which this is the first.

Given the information above we may have a closer relation-

ship with you, for example you may feel "your" MPA is appropriate for this study... Or you may simply remain on our circulation list and observe and comment on the work. We do encourage active participation, so should you find something of interest and wish to know more OR want to comment on our direction, methodology etc. please contact one of us at the email address below.

We recognise the huge demands on your time, but hope that these small "windows"

into the research will serve to inform, share results and stimulate feedback from you.

Even if you have no input at this stage, please keep this brief as it gives you our contact details and an overview of what we are hoping to achieve. If you know of people or institutions who might be interested in this work please forward this brief. We are more than happy to add to our circulation list so send us your contact details if you want to add your name.

WHO is involved?

The project is implemented through a partnership between MRAG Ltd. and NRM-UWI, with the collaboration of the Caribbean Natural Resources Institute (CANARI)



Dr Caroline Garaway
Nicole Kenward
Vicki Cowan

*MRAG Ltd
47 Prince's Gate
London, SW7 2QA
England*

Phone: +44 (0)207 594 9888
Fax: +44 (0)207 823 7916
Email: n.kenward@ic.ac.uk



Professor Wayne Hunte
Dr Hazel Oxenford
Dr Winston Anderson

*Natural Resource Management
Programme
University of the West Indies
Cave Hill Campus
Barbados*

Phone: +1 246 417 4571
Fax: +1 246 424 4204
Email: hoxenford@uwichill.edu.bb